

SINNOTT, PUEBLA, CAMPAGNE & CURET, APLC

550 S. HOPE ST., SUITE 2350
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90071-2618
TEL (213) 996-4200 • FAX (213) 892-8322

1 SINNOTT, PUEBLA, CAMPAGNE & CURET, APLC

2 Randolph P. Sinnott, #107301

3 rsinnott@spcclaw.com

4 Debra R. Puebla, #126934

5 dpuebla@spcclaw.com

6 550 S. Hope St., Suite 2350

7 Los Angeles, California 90071-2618

8 Tel.: (213) 996-4200; Fax: (213) 892-8322

9 Attorneys for AMERICAN ZURICH INSURANCE COMPANY

10
11 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

12 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION**

13
14 AMERICAN ZURICH INSURANCE
15 COMPANY,

16 Plaintiff,

17 vs.

18 JAMES N. GRAY COMPANY;
19 GRAY-I.C.E. BUILDERS, INC.; I.C.E.
20 BUILDERS, INC.; LIBERTY
21 MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY;
22 TRAVELERS PROPERTY
23 CASUALTY COMPANY OF
24 AMERICA; VALLEY FORGE
25 INSURANCE COMPANY; SAFECO
26 INSURANCE COMPANY OF
27 AMERICA; ST. PAUL FIRE AND
28 MARINE INSURANCE COMPANY;
and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive,

Defendant.

Case No. 8:13CV1966 AG (JPRx)

Hon. Andrew J. Guilford

**JUDGMENT IN FAVOR OF
AMERICAN ZURICH INSURANCE
COMPANY AGAINST
TRAVELERS PROPERTY
CASUALTY COMPANY OF
AMERICA AND ST. PAUL FIRE
AND MARINE INSURANCE
COMPANY**

Pursuant to Stipulation consenting to a Trial by the Court and on the Court's own motion, a Bench Trial was held on June 24, 2015. Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and trial briefs were submitted by plaintiff American Zurich Insurance Company ("Zurich"), and defendants St. Paul Fire and Marine Insurance Company ("St. Paul") and Travelers Property Casualty Company of America ("Travelers").

On August 13, 2015, the Court, having fully considered the Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusion of Law and the trial briefs, as well as oral argument of counsel for Zurich, St. Paul and Travelers, filed its FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSION OF LAW (Doc. 88, attached), which is fully incorporated herein.

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that:

1. St. Paul shall have judgment entered against it and in favor of Zurich in the amount of \$69,756.50. This amount represents St. Paul's equitable contribution of \$59,756.50 in defense costs and \$10,000.00 in indemnity to settle *Robert Molina et al. v. 3M Company et al.*, Los Angeles County Superior Court, Case No. BC463374 (the "*Molina* Action").

2. Travelers shall have judgment entered against it and in favor of Zurich in the amount of \$226,164.48. This amount represents Travelers' equitable contribution of \$176,164.48 in defense costs and \$50,000.00 in indemnity to settle the *Molina* Action.

3. Zurich shall be awarded its costs in the sum of \$_____.

4. The amounts paid by Zurich in defense (\$499,948.64) and indemnity (\$70,000.00) in connection with the *Molina* Action are deemed reasonable.

///

///

///

///

1 5. Pursuant to the Court's Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law,
2 Travelers and St. Paul shall have 14 days from the date of service of this [Proposed]
3 Judgment to file any objections. If no objections are received by the Court within
4 14 days, the judgment will be entered immediately and Federal Rules of Civil
5 Procedure 52(b) will apply on entry of judgment.

6
7 Dated: August 25, 2015



Andrew J. Guilford
United States District Judge

SINNOTT, PUEBLA, CAMPAGNE & CURET, APLC

550 S. HOPE ST., SUITE 2350
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90071-2618
TEL (213) 996-4200 • FAX (213) 892-8322